

The stable problem of the black-hole connected region in the Schwarzschild black hole *

Guihua Tian^{1,2}

1.School of Science, Beijing University
of Posts And Telecommunications. Beijing100876, China.

2.Academy of Mathematics and Systems Science,
Chinese Academy of Sciences,(CAS) Beijing, 100080, P.R. China

October 18, 2004

Abstract

The stability of the Schwarzschild black hole is studied. Using the Painlevé coordinate, our region can be defined as the **black-hole-connected region** ($r > 2m$, see text) of the Schwarzschild black hole or the **white-hole-connected region** ($r > 2m$, see text) of the Schwarzschild black hole. We study the stable problems of the **black-hole-connected region**. The conclusions are: (1) in the **black-hole-connected region**, the initially regular perturbation fields must have real frequency or complex frequency whose imaginary must not be greater than $-\frac{1}{4m}$, so the **black-hole-connected region** is stable in physicist's viewpoint; (2) On the contrary, in the mathematicians' viewpoint, the existence of the real frequencies means that the stable problem is unsolved by the linear perturbation method in the **black-hole-connected region**.

PACC:0420-q

Studies on the stability of the Schwarzschild black hole are of great importance both in theoretical and cosmological back-grounds. The Schwarzschild black hole is the only candidate for the spherically static vacuum space-time. It is generally believed that it is the ultimate fate of massive star after getting off its angular momentum. Also, Many theoretical results heavily rely on their applications to the the Schwarzschild black hole.

Regge and Wheeler first studied the problem, and divided the perturbations into odd and even ones [1]. The odd one is really the angular perturbation to the metric, while even one corresponds to the radial perturbation to the metric [2]. The odd perturbation equation is the well-known Regge-Wheeler equation.

Vishveshwara made the study further by transforming the perturbation quantities to the Kruskal reference frame, and tried to find the real divergence at $r = 2m$ from the spurious one caused by the improper choice of coordinate due to the Schwarzschild metric's ill-defined-ness at $r = 2m$ [3]. Later, Price also studied the problem carefully [4] and Wald studied from the mathematical background [5]. In this paper, we give full consideration on the perturbation fields with complex frequency. Using the Painlevé coordinate, our region can be defined as the **black-hole-connected region** ($r > 2m$, see text) of the Schwarzschild black hole or the **white-hole-connected region** ($r > 2m$, see text) of the Schwarzschild black hole. We study the stable problems of the two kinds of region.

In reference [6], Stewart applied the Liapounoff theorem to define dynamical stability of a black-hole. First, according Stewart, the normal mode of the perturbation fields to the Schwarzschild black-hole is the perturbation fields Ψ with time-dependence of e^{-ikt} which are bounded at the boundaries of the event horizon $r = 2m$ and the infinity $r \rightarrow \infty$. The range of permitted frequency is defined as the spectrum S of the Schwarzschild black-hole. Then, for the Schwarzschild black-hole, it could be obtained by the Liapounoff theorem that[6]:

*E-mail of Tian: hua2007@126.com, tgh-2000@263.net

- (1)if $\exists k \in S$ with $\Im k > 0$, the Schwarzschild black-hole is dynamically unstable,
(2)if $\Im k < 0$ for $\forall k \in S$, and the normal modes are complete, then, the Schwarzschild black-hole is dynamically stable,
(3)if $\Im k \leq 0$ for $\forall k \in S$, and there is at least one real frequency $k \in S$, the linearized approach could not decide the stability of the Schwarzschild black-hole.

Here, we reconsider the stability problem of the Schwarzschild black hole using the Painlevé coordinate metric(see following). The conclusions are: (1) in the **black-hole-connected region**, the initially regular perturbation fields must have real frequency or complex frequency whose imaginary must not be greater than $-\frac{1}{4m}$, so the **black-hole-connected region** is stable in usual physicist' viewpoint; (2) On the contrary, in the mathematicians' viewpoint [6], the existence of the real frequencies means that the stable problem is unsolved by the linear perturbation method in the **black-hole-connected region** too.

First, we give a brief introduction of the odd perturbation of the Schwarzschild black-hole[1]. The Schwarzschild metric is

$$ds^2 = -(1 - \frac{2m}{r})dt_s^2 + (1 - \frac{2m}{r})^{-1}dr^2 + r^2d\Omega^2. \quad (1)$$

By mode decomposition, the odd perturbation fields h_{03} and h_{13} can be written as

$$h_{03} = h_0(r)e^{-i\omega t_s} \left[\sin \theta \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \right] P_l(\cos \theta), \quad (2)$$

$$h_{13} = h_1(r)e^{-i\omega t_s} \left[\sin \theta \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \right] P_l(\cos \theta). \quad (3)$$

The dynamical perturbation equation, the Regge-Wheeler equation, is

$$\frac{d^2 Q}{dr^{*2}} + [k^2 - V] Q = 0, \quad (4)$$

where the effective potential V and the tortoise coordinate are

$$V = \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) \left[\frac{l(l+1)}{r^2} - \frac{6m}{r^3} \right], \quad (5)$$

$$r^* = r + 2m \ln \left(\frac{r}{2m} - 1 \right) \quad (6)$$

respectively. The quantity Q is connected with the odd perturbation fields h_0, h_1 by

$$h_0(r) = \frac{i}{k} \frac{d}{dr^*} (rQ) = \frac{i}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) Q + r \frac{dQ}{dr^*} \right] \quad (7)$$

and

$$h_1(r) = r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1} Q. \quad (8)$$

Just as done in the reference [3], we first solve the eq.(4) to get the odd perturbation quantities h_{03}, h_{13} in the Schwarzschild metric coordinates for simplification, then transform them to the Painlevé coordinate frame to study the stable problem.

There are two independent solutions $f_1(r), f_2(r)$ to the eq.(4) with following asymptotic properties at infinity $r^* \rightarrow \infty$:

$$f_1(r) \rightarrow A_1 r e^{-ikr^*}, r^* \rightarrow \infty, \quad (9)$$

$$f_2(r) \rightarrow A_2 r e^{ikr^*}, r^* \rightarrow \infty. \quad (10)$$

$f_1(r), f_2(r)$ corresponds to ingoing and out-going radiation from infinity respectively. Similarly, there also are two independent solutions $f_3(r), f_4(r)$ to the eq.(4), which have the asymptotic forms

$$f_3(r) \rightarrow A_3 r e^{-ikr^*}, r^* \rightarrow -\infty \quad (11)$$

$$f_4(r) \rightarrow A_4 r e^{ikr^*} r^* \rightarrow -\infty. \quad (12)$$

at $r = 2m$ or $r^* \rightarrow -\infty$. $f_3(r)$, $f_4(r)$ are the ingoing and out-going radiation from the black-hole horizon respectively. The relations of the four solutions $f_1(r)$, $f_2(r)$, $f_3(r)$, $f_4(r)$ are following:

$$f_1(r) = C_{13}f_3 + C_{14}f_4, \quad (13)$$

$$f_2(r) = C_{23}f_3 + C_{24}f_4, \quad (14)$$

or equivalently

$$f_3(r) = C_{31}f_1 + C_{32}f_2, \quad (15)$$

$$f_4(r) = C_{41}f_1 + C_{42}f_2. \quad (16)$$

The Schwarzschild metric is singular at $r = 2m$, so, we could not discuss the stable problem under this metric. To find the real divergence at $r = 2m$ from the spurious one caused by the improper choice of coordinate due to its ill-defined-ness at $r = 2m$ [3], Vishveshwara studied the perturbation quantities in the reference frame regular at $r = 2m$, that is, the Kruskal reference frame. Instead, the regular reference frame we select is the Painlevé frame, which is stationary and regular at the horizon [9].

The Painlevé coordinate for the Schwarzschild black hole is

$$ds^2 = -\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) dt_p^2 + 2\sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} dr dt_p + dr^2 + r^2 d\Omega^2. \quad (17)$$

The Painlevé metric (17) is obtained from the Schwarzschild metric (1) by the transformation[7]-[9]

$$t_p = t_s + \left[2\sqrt{2mr} + 2m \ln \frac{\sqrt{r} - \sqrt{2m}}{\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{2m}} \right], \quad (18)$$

and is obviously regular, especially at the horizon $r = 2m$.

In the usual Penrose diagram, part *I* corresponds to our region($r > 2m$), parts *II* and *II'* are the black-hole($r < 2m$) and white-hole($r < 2m$) respectively, and part *I'* is another region($r > 2m$) not communicating with our region. We define the region *I* connected with *II* by the metric (17) as the **black-hole-connected region**.

Similarly, the **white-hole-connected region** is defined as the region *I* connected with *II'* by the metric

$$\begin{aligned} ds^2 &= -\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) dt_p^2 - 2\sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} dr dt_p + dr^2 + r^2 d\Omega^2 \\ &= -dt_p^2 + \left(dr - \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} dt_p\right)^2 + r^2 d\Omega^2. \end{aligned} \quad (19)$$

The metric (19) comes from the Schwarzschild metric (1) by the transformation[7]-[9]

$$t_p = t_s - \left[2\sqrt{2mr} + 2m \ln \frac{\sqrt{r} - \sqrt{2m}}{\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{2m}} \right]. \quad (20)$$

By equation (18) it is easy to get the perturbation fields $[h_{ij}^p]$ in the metric (17) of Painlevé coordinates:

$$h_{03}^p = h_{03}^s \quad (21)$$

$$h_{13}^p = h_{13}^s - \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1} h_{03}^s. \quad (22)$$

Using equations (2)-(3)) and (7)-(8), we could get,

$$h_{03}^p = \frac{i}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) Q + r \frac{dQ}{dr^*} \right] e^{-ikt_s}, \quad (23)$$

$$h_{13}^p = \left\{ \frac{i}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} Q + r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r} \right)^{-1} \left[-\frac{i}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \frac{dQ}{dr^*} + Q \right] \right\} e^{-ikt_s}. \quad (24)$$

Now, we study the stable problem.

Corresponding to the in-going radiations f_1, f_3 , the asymptotic forms of the fields h_{03}, h_{13} are

$$\begin{aligned} h_{03}^p(t_p, r) &\propto \frac{1}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r} \right) - ikr \right] e^{-ik(t_s+r^*)}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \\ &= \frac{1}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r} \right) - ikr \right] e^{-ikt_p} e^{ik[-r+2\sqrt{2mr}-4m \ln(1+\sqrt{\frac{r}{2m}})]}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \end{aligned} \quad (25)$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} h_{13}^p(t_p, r) &\propto \left[\frac{1}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} + r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r} \right)^{-1} \left(\frac{1}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} (-k) + 1 \right) \right] e^{-ik(t_s+r^*)}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \\ &= \left[\frac{1}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} + r \left(1 + \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \right)^{-1} \right] e^{-ikt_p} e^{ik[-r+2\sqrt{2mr}-4m \ln(1+\sqrt{\frac{r}{2m}})]}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \end{aligned} \quad (26)$$

respectively. Similarly, corresponding to the out-going radiations f_2, f_4 , the asymptotic forms of the fields h_{03}, h_{13} are

$$\begin{aligned} h_{03}^p(t_p, r) &\propto \frac{1}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r} \right) + ikr \right] e^{-ik(t_s-r^*)}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \\ &= \frac{1}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r} \right) + ikr \right] e^{-ikt_p} e^{2ikr^*} e^{ik[-r+2\sqrt{2mr}-4m \ln(1+\sqrt{\frac{r}{2m}})]}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \end{aligned} \quad (27)$$

$$\begin{aligned} h_{13}^p(t_p, r) &\propto \left[\frac{1}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} + r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r} \right)^{-1} \left(\frac{1}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} * k + 1 \right) \right] e^{-ik(t_s-r^*)}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \\ &= \left[\frac{1}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} + r \left(1 - \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \right)^{-1} \right] e^{-ikt_p} e^{2ikr^*} e^{ik[-r+2\sqrt{2mr}-4m \ln(1+\sqrt{\frac{r}{2m}})]}, \quad r^* \rightarrow \pm\infty \end{aligned} \quad (28)$$

respectively.

First, to make $h_{03}^p(t_p, r), h_{13}^p(t_p, r)$ regular initially at infinity, we must have the following selections for the frequency $k = k_1 + ik_2$ with $k_1 = \Re k, k_2 = \Im k$:

$$Q_\infty = \begin{cases} f_1 & \text{if } k_2 < 0, \\ f_2 & \text{if } k_2 > 0, \\ B_1 f_1 + B_2 f_2 & \text{if } k_2 = 0 \end{cases}$$

Similarly, at the horizon, the regularity of the fields $h_{03}^p(t_p, r), h_{13}^p(t_p, r)$ requires

$$Q_{2m} = \begin{cases} f_3 & \text{if } k_2 > -\frac{1}{4m}, \\ B_3 f_3 + B_4 f_4 & \text{if } k_2 \leq -\frac{1}{4m} \end{cases}$$

Therefore, if $k_2 > 0$, to make $h_{03}^p(t_p, r), h_{13}^p(t_p, r)$ well-behaved initially, we must select $Q_\infty = f_2$ and $Q_{2m} = f_3$. From the equation (14), we have

$$f_2(r) = C_{23} f_3 + C_{24} f_4. \quad (29)$$

By the theorem of the quantum mechanics, it is easy to get

$$C_{24} \neq 0.$$

It is easy to see that there is a contradiction, so, $k_2 > 0$ is impossible for the black-hole-connected region.

When $-\frac{1}{4m} < k_2 < 0$, we must select $Q_\infty = f_1$ and $Q_{2m} = f_3$. This also a contradiction to the relation (13). So, $-\frac{1}{4m} < k_2 < 0$ is impossible for initially well-defined fields $h_{03}^p(t_p, r)$, $h_{13}^p(t_p, r)$.

When $k_2 \leq -\frac{1}{4m}$, then $Q_\infty = f_1$ and $Q_{2m} = C_{13}f_3 + C_{14}f_4$. This is a possibility to make the fields $h_{03}^p(t_p, r)$, $h_{13}^p(t_p, r)$ well-behaved initially, though the physical meaning is not too clear. In such case, an ingoing radiation from infinity f_1 is scattered by the black-hole's effective potential V , and the reflected radiation f_2 is cancelled. There is the transmitted radiation f_3 falling into the black-hole. However, it is a strange thing that there exists an outgoing radiation from the black-hole. What does intrigue this kind of outgoing radiation from the black-hole? Moreover, this kind radiation from the black-hole does transmit the black-hole's effective potential V , and cancel the reflected radiation from infinity. In this very case, the radiations all diminish exponentially in time.

The last possibility is $k_2 = 0$. In this case, we have

$$\begin{cases} Q_{2m} &= f_3 \\ Q_\infty &= C_{31}f_1 + C_{32}f_2 \end{cases}$$

This is just what Vishveshwara have obtained in reference [11]. Its physical meaning is obvious: for an ingoing radiation f_1 from infinity, some of it is reflected by the hole, and the other transmits and falls into the black-hole (f_3 is the transmitted radiation, and f_2 is the reflected radiation).

Summary: to make the fields $h_{03}^p(t_p, r)$, $h_{13}^p(t_p, r)$ well-behaved initially in the **black-hole-connected region**, we only have two choices: (1) $\Im k < -\frac{1}{4m}$, or (2) $\Im k = 0$. The physical meaning corresponds to the first choice is unclear yet, the second have clear physical meaning. The conclusion is that the **black-hole-connected region** is stable according to the definition of physicists', but is instable to the definition of the mathematician' [6].

Similar calculation could applied to the **white-hole-connected region**[12]. It is easy to see that there exists initially well-behaved fields $h_{03}^p(t_p, r)$, $h_{13}^p(t_p, r)$ with $\Re k = 0$ and $\text{Im} k > 0$, so, the **white-hole-connected region** is unstable.

Acknowledgments

We are supported in part by the National Science Foundation of China under Grant No.10475013, No.10373003, No.10375087, No.10375008, NKDRTC(2004CB318000) and the post-doctor foundation of China.

References

- [1] T. Regge, J. A. Wheeler 1957 Phys. Rev. *108*, 1063 .
- [2] S. Chandrasekhar 1983 The mathematical theory of black hole. (Oxford: Oxford University Press), Ch4, p139.
- [3] C. V. Vishveshwara 1970 Phys. Rev. *D1*, 2870 .
- [4] R. Press 1972 Phys. Rev. *D5*, 2419 .
- [5] R. M. Wald 1979 J. Math. Phys. *20*, 1056 .
- [6] J. M. Stewart 1975 Proc. R. Soc. *A344*, 65 .
- [7] M. K. Parikh, F. Wilczek 2000 Phys. Rev. Lett. *85*, 5042.
- [8] P. Painlevé, C. R. Hebd 1921 Seances Acad. Sci. *173*, 677.
- [9] P. Kraus, F. Wilczek 1994 Mod. Phys. Lett. *A9*, 3713 .

- [10] P. Kraus, F. Wilczek 1996 Nucl. Phys.*B433*, 403 .
- [11] C. V. Vishveshwara 1970 Nature*227*, 936.
- [12] Guihua Tian, Shikun Wang, Zhao Zheng, web arxiv: gr-qc0504055.